



**IFLA Cataloguing Section  
FRBR Review Group**

**Meeting Report  
Seoul, August 20, 2006**

The FRBR Review Group had one meeting on the occasion of the World Library and Information Congress in Seoul, on Sunday, August 20th, 2006. It was attended by 16 participants from 9 countries (see Appendix A).

**1) Welcome and Announcements**

Members Carol van Nuys and Lynne Howarth sent regrets as they were unable to attend IFLA this year. Lynne Howarth, whose term had been to 2007, requested to step down from the RG one year early. The Division's procedures for review groups do not presently specify the process for replacing members who step down prior to the ends of their terms. Thus, at the CB I meeting the RG was requested to select a replacement member and specify a term, subject to ratification at the Cataloguing SC II meeting. The FRBR Review Group unanimously suggested Anders Cato (presently chair of the WG on the Expression entity) as the new member, for an initial term of 3 years (to 2009), with possibility of renewal. [This was unanimously accepted at the SC II meeting on Aug. 25.]

**2) Chair's report on activities during the year**

Items additional to those reported on in the [FRBR RG annual report for 2005-2006](#):

i) The FRBR Review Group was officially represented at the following conferences and meetings:

IME-ICC3, Cairo, Dec. 12-14, 2005: Elena Escolano Rodriguez presented *Brave new FRBR world* which had been updated by Patrick Le Bœuf.

UNIMARC and Friends, Lisbon, March 20-21, 2006: Patrick Le Bœuf presented a talk entitled: *"Modelling bibliographic information: purposes, prospects, potential"*

INTEGRAR, São Paulo, June 26-30, 2006: Pat Riva presented a plenary and a one-day post-conference workshop on FRBR.

IME-ICC4, Seoul, Aug. 16-18, 2006: Pat Riva presented *Brave new FRBR world* which had been slightly updated by Pat Riva and Patrick Le Bœuf.

ii) The chair cannot always accept all speaking or representation invitations personally, and as needed will seek volunteers from among the members.

iii) The chair contacted Ed Jones, chair of the CONSER Task Force on FRBR and Continuing Resources. However, he reports that they do not have specific amendment proposals for us at this time; the TF has been dormant due to activity with RDA.

iv) FRBR translations: The Chinese translation is complete, publication is imminent. A Hungarian translation is to be started. This brings the completed translations to 13, and those in progress to 6.

v) Website was maintained without major reorganization. Presently the Review Group membership is not given on the site. Members had no objection to adding the membership list.

### **3) Review RG terms of reference**

i) Identify actions in response to recommendations from ICABS vendor survey (survey results previously distributed).

Discussion focused on the recommendation that the RG should give more priority to advocacy, specifically developing evidence-based arguments that demonstrate the value of FRBR. This recommendation stems from the observation that vendors have a perception that FRBR implementation is costly, and that purchasers of systems are not sufficiently aware of the benefits of FRBR for end users to request it. Demonstration projects have great potential in demonstrating value concretely. The RG can certainly promote and disseminate work in this area, but cannot endorse any projects. The bibliography is a logical place to include reports of practical projects, but the bibliography is becoming substantial, and as it is not annotated nothing highlights specific items.

**Action:** Start an annotated guide to recommended resources on specific topics. First, select and evaluate/annotate a small number of introductory readings, intended as a good place to start learning about FRBR. Second, a guide to existing demonstration projects.

**Action:** Write for FAQs a section on the benefits of FRBR for end-users.

ii) The RG terms of reference were adopted in 2003 and have not been revisited since. In light of progress made since then, it is time to revise them.

**Action:** The chair will send out an initial draft for comment.

iii) Maintenance of the bibliography: Patrick Le Bœuf continues as editor, members need to be more proactive in sending him citations of articles, reports that are relevant.

**Action:** David Miller volunteers to perform link-checking 3-4 times a year to assist in maintenance.

### **4) Procedure for approving modifications/amendments to FRBR final report**

Reviewed the second draft dated Aug. 10, 2006 and made further refinements. (Revision attached as app. B.) The ideal for publishing amendments so that they cannot be overlooked by those who download FRBR from IFLANET would be to integrate them into the text right away, without waiting to produce a cumulation/new edition. However, this requires access to the 1998 text as a word processing file. Judy Kuhagen will check with IFLA HQ to see if this can be located.

Reviewed and refined a cover memo and invitation for the world-wide review of the expression entity amendment. This memo can also serve as a template for future world-wide reviews.

### **5) Reports from Working Groups**

#### **5.1) WG on Expression Entity (A. Cato)**

Preparation of the proposal for modification of text of FRBR section 3.2.2 took longer than planned as the discussion re-opened several times during the year. Examples have been received from some members, but more are welcome. The FAQ text has not been drafted; in previous discussions a separate web page for the expression FAQ and examples had been imagined; now it seems more useful to integrate expression information in the main FRBR website and FAQs. The RG confirmed that, pending final discussion at the WG meeting on Aug. 21, the expression entity proposal would be sent for World-Wide review.

## 5.2) WG on Teaching and Training (M. Žumer)

The RG thanked the WG for their efforts and accepted the recommendation from the working group to disband; however, a teaching resources section will be maintained in the FRBR bibliography. The package of recommended resources for learning FRBR (action above) responds to the need identified for more assistance from the continuing education perspective, rather than from formal professional education in library schools.

## 5.3) WG on FRBR/CRM dialogue (M. Žumer for P. Le Bœuf)

This group has been meeting 3 times per year; the next meeting is scheduled for Oct. 25-27 in Heraklion, Crete (Greece). A recent draft of the object-oriented FRBR (FRBRoo) was circulated on the FRBR list and the version updated at the WG's June meeting is available on the CIDOC website ([http://cidoc.ics.forth.gr/frbr\\_drafts.html](http://cidoc.ics.forth.gr/frbr_drafts.html)). It will be posted also on IFLANET.

## 5.4) WG on Aggregates (E. O'Neill)

Issues relating to aggregates in the form of collections will be the immediate focus. The work of the Expression entity WG has an impact on the handling of augmentations.

## 6) Continue examination of chart with suggestions for changes to FRBR

The chair proposed a method of procedure:

First, sort the suggestions in the chart by status:

*rejected*: those either not in scope for FRBR, or that the group has determined are not pertinent (although it is important to retain a record of the suggestion and the reason for rejection);

*postponed*: for instance those originating from FRANAR will only be acted on once FRAR is approved;

*active*: those requiring further work.

Next, the active suggestions will be prioritized, and the sections of FRBR that they relate to identified. This will allow work/analysis to be assigned.

**Action:** The chair will sort the chart as proposed and circulate it.

David Miller had raised the issue of genre/form with the FRSAR group, whose chair, Marcia Lei Zeng, pointed out that this is actually an attribute of the group 1 entities. The scope of FRSAR is “aboutness”, it does not extend to everything currently conveyed by subject heading schemes. FRBR does have attributes such as “form of work” (whose examples imply genre), “form of expression”, “form of carrier”, but the term genre does not appear. Clarification of this issue will be entered into the chart of suggestions.

The [ISBD/FRBR mapping](#) also contains a number of specific suggestions about attributes and relationships not listed in FRBR, these will be added to the chart as new suggestions.

**Action:** The chair will enter these into the chart while updating it.

## Appendix A

### List of participants

Name	Institution	Country	Status
Cato, Anders	National Library of Sweden	Sweden	new member, chair of the WG on the Expression entity, member of the WG on Aggregates
Cordeiro, Maria Inès	Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation Art Library	Portugal	observer
Danskin, Alan	British Library	UK	member
Guerrini, Mauro	University of Florence	Italy	observer, member of the WG on Teaching and Training
Hengel, Christel	German National Library	Germany	observer
Hostage, John	Harvard Law School	USA	observer, Cataloguing Section liaison to CC:DA
Kuhagen, Judith	Library of Congress	USA	Cataloguing Section SC chair, member of the WG on Aggregates
Miller, David	Curry College	USA	observer
O'Neill, Ed	OCLC	USA	member, chair of the WG on Aggregates, member of the WG on the Expression entity
Patton, Glenn	OCLC	USA	member, chair of FRANAR
Ramos, Cristina	Calouste Gulbenkian Foundation Art Library	Portugal	observer
Riva, Pat	McGill University	Canada	Chair of FRBR RG
Thurston, Patricia	Yale University	USA	observer, new member of the WG on Aggregates
Tillett, Barbara	Library of Congress	USA	member, member of the WG on the Expression entity and member of the WG on Aggregates
Zagorskaya, Elena	National Library of Russia	Russia	observer, member of the WG on the Expression entity
Žumer, Maja	University of Ljubljana	Slovenia	member, chair of the WG on Teaching and Training, member of the WG on Aggregates and WG on FRBR/CRM Harmonisation, co-chair of FRSAR

## Appendix B

### Process for the approval and publication of amendments to FRBR

- 1) Suggestions for revisions to FRBR from any source are forwarded to the Chair of the FRBR Review Group who will make a preliminary assessment.
- 2) Suggestions for revisions are then given a further assessment by the FRBR Review Group. The Review Group can choose to follow through on a suggestion itself, or assign the work to an individual member or to a Working Group.
- 3) Once a specific textual change to FRBR is proposed, (if through a Working Group, then after consensus by the Working Group members), it is forwarded to the Chair of the Review Group.
- 4) The Chair of the Review Group forwards the revised text and any background documentation to the Review Group members by email for an initial consultation period of at least 4 weeks.
- 5) Should the initial consultation result in any further questions, revisions, corrections, these are returned to the relevant Working Group or member for consideration and eventual incorporation into the proposal. (back to #3)
- 6) When email consultation indicates consensus, the Chair of the Review Group will, with notification to the Chair of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, forward the proposal to the Review Group requesting approval to begin worldwide review. The Chair of the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee can decide to forward the proposal to the Standing Committee at this point.
- 7) Invitations for worldwide review are posted on IFLANET, and circulated on the FRBR listserv and other appropriate lists, for a 3-month period.
- 8) Comments received as a result of the worldwide review are considered by the FRBR Review Group, and if appropriate, by the originating Working Group.
- 9) The Chair of the Review Group forwards the revised text to the Review Group members by email for a final 4-week consultation period. If extensive revisions were made at this stage, the Review Group could recommend another worldwide review.
- 10) Once approved by the Review Group, the Chair of the Review Group forwards the proposed amendment(s), and any background documentation, to the Cataloguing Section Standing Committee, including recommendations about how to publish them.
- 11) The Cataloguing Section SC approves the proposed amendment(s) and decides how to publish them. If a new edition of the complete FRBR text is being compiled, the SC discusses with IFLA Headquarters about whether the IFLA publisher should publish a new printed edition.
- 12) Approved modifications are announced widely, including in *SCATNews*, *International Cataloguing and Bibliographic Control*, other relevant publications, IFLA-L, the FRBR list, other relevant lists, and the FRBR blog.
- 13) Ideally, approved modifications are integrated into the PDF and HTML versions of FRBR on

IFLANET so that the version offered for downloading is always the latest one.

i) In addition, for brief changes affecting only a few pages of FRBR, the amended pages are also made available separately in PDF on IFLANET, for ease of identifying updates. These amendments are placed prominently on the final report web page and in the publications section of the Cataloguing Section's page. This listing will include mention of the sections being amended. These amendments are sequentially numbered within the edition they amend (e.g., the first amendment to the 1998 first edition is numbered 1998-01).

ii) Once sufficient brief amendments accumulate, or should there be a large amendment or package of related amendments, the complete FRBR text would move to a new edition.